

MINUTES

Columbus and Franklin County, Ohio

Continuum of Care Meeting

Wednesday, February 1, 2023

11:30am – 1:00pm

Virtual Meeting

Attendance

Continuum of Care (CoC) members: Adam Troy, Andy Keller, Beth Fetzer-Rice, Carl Landry, Chanda Wingo, Tina Rutherford for Chip Spinning, Christopher Maitland for Councilmember Shayla D. Favor, Dayna McCray, Donna Mayer, Dr. Maria Houston, Emerald Hernandez-Parra, Emily Savors, Frank Beel, Geneé Cosby, Hannah Estabrook, Jeff Pattison, Jonathan Welty, Nathan Flores for Kelsey Strausbaugh, Kier Scott, Lark Mallory, Le-Ann Harris, Lisa Phillips, Lt. Kyle Kincade, Mason Alexander, Michael Wilkos, Roxann Payne, Scott Scharlach for Charles Hillman, Shannon Isom, Sheila Prillerman, Steve Smith, Sue Darby, Terri Power
Community Shelter Board (CSB) staff: Lianna Barbu, Steve Skovensky, Kirstin Jones, Gillian Gunawan

Continuum of Care (CoC) members (not in attendance): Buck Bramlish (Veterans Service Commission), Sue Villilo (ADAMH Board), Felisha Lyons (Columbus City Schools – Project Connect), Jerome Johnson (Citizens Advisory Council), Jim Rose (Columbus Coalition for the Homeless), Jon Cardi (CSB Board), Rei Scott (Youth Action Board), Tiara Ross (Office of the Columbus City Attorney)

Administrative Issues

Minutes

Michael Wilkos asked for additions to and approval of the minutes from the October 12, 2022 CoC meeting. Adam Troy motioned, Sheila Prillerman seconded, and the CoC agreed.

Annual Financial Report

Lianna Barbu presented the annual financial report for FY22 which summarizes system-wide sources and uses of funds and analyzes costs per households served and costs per successful outcomes for all program types.

- < Sources of Funds are split between CSB Funds and Partner Agency Leveraged Funds. CSB brought in \$40 million, Partner Agencies leveraged \$21 million. Overall, \$61 million were used for homelessness programs in FY22.
- < ADAMH contributions of \$1.4 mil and CMHA rental subsidies through voucher programs of over \$6 mil are significant and contribute towards the sustainability of homelessness programs.
- < Some of the City, County, and State revenues show variances between budgeted and actual amounts because these grants' contract periods do not align with CSB's fiscal

year. The variances do not indicate changes in funding amounts. There are no concerns about actual grants.

- < Expenses show many variances due to receiving additional COVID dollars for Emergency Shelters through the State, and due to partners' continued issues with staffing shortages and a lack of affordable housing.
- < Michael asked what happens if agencies' spend-down issues with staffing and housing persist, and what happens to unspent funds. Lianna responded that agencies have seen improvement in staffing, and that the system is in a better position now than a year ago; unspent funds carry over into the next fiscal year, and CSB prioritizes spending based on which funds will expire first.

Annual PSH Cost Report

The annual PSH operating cost report compares the FY23 budget to the FY22 actuals for PSH programs.

- < The system has an inventory of 2,444 PSH units; these were projected to cost \$15,268 on average, but the actual cost to operate was about \$1000 less at \$14,268. This is consistent with the previous fiscal year's budget vs. actuals.
- < Units are also analyzed by tenant attributes (low, medium, or high need), staff availability (limited, moderate, intensive), household type (single, family, or combo), and whether the unit is single or scattered site.
 - o Generally, single site projects cost more because they have front desk costs that scattered sites don't have. Single site units cost on average \$14,428, while scattered site units cost on average \$12,027.
 - o Units that serve high need tenants cost an average of \$16,834 versus units that serve medium need tenants costing on average \$10,972.
 - o Intensive staff availability units cost an average of \$18,276, while limited staff availability units cost on average \$14,345.
 - o Family projects cost significantly less to operate than single or combo projects at an average of \$9,583/unit. Single projects cost \$15,056/unit and combo projects cost \$12,588/unit.

Strategic Issues

Prioritization for Ohio Housing Finance Agency tax credits

The CoC Board had considered and prioritized Community Housing Network's Touchstone Field Place 2 in the January meeting for 9% tax credits. In the meantime, CHN withdrew their application. They will continue to pursue 4% tax credits in combination with 2021 ARPA funds. There are no projects looking for OHFA competitive tax credits this year.

Lianna reviewed the PSH in Development Summary.

- < 1400 more units of Permanent Supportive Housing are still needed in the community.

- < Projects funded and in progress include CHN's Touchstone Field Place 2, Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority's McKinley Manor, National Church Residences' Berwyn East Place, and CHN's Poplar Fen Place, all set to open over the course of the next year and a half.
- < Projects in the pipeline but not yet fully funded include Homefull's Leasing Expansion, Beacon Communities/YMCA 80 S. 6th Street, and the CHN Replacement Project.

System & Community Framework Updates

System and Program Indicator Report

Lianna provided highlights from the FY23 Quarter 1 System and Program Indicator Report which includes data from 7/1/22 – 9/30/22.

- < An overall lack of available safe, decent, and affordable housing makes it very difficult to move clients quickly out of shelter.
- < In the Family System, 42% more households needed shelter when compared to the same reporting period in FY22. Families stay in shelter longer and throughout the evaluation timeframe we used a hotel to accommodate 25 families due to lack of space in emergency shelters. Families are unable to exit to housing, due to limited availability of affordable housing.
- < Single men and single women are also experiencing longer lengths of shelter stay and lower success rates at exit from shelters. 62% of men and 70% of women self-reported having a disability.
- < Overall the system was in Overflow during the entire time frame. 60% of households served were newly homeless.
 - o Michael asked what defines “newly homeless.” The Federal definition is that a “newly homeless” person has not been in the shelter system for the past 2 years, which means 40% of those served have been homeless on and off for the past 2 years.
 - o Terri Power asked how this compares to previous years. Lianna responded that the number has been fairly stable.
- < In the Homelessness Prevention system, the number of households served decreased 19% when compared to the same reporting period of the prior fiscal year, likely due to COVID related funding starting to decrease. The successful housing outcome rate decreased by 5 percentage points to 87%.
- < In the Rapid Re-housing system, the goal metric of successful housing outcomes was met at 54%. Average length of participation increased from 183 to 204 days, another indicator of the difficulty in locating housing.
 - o Steve Skovensky noted that RRH programs in particular are negatively impacted by staff vacancies.
- < In the Permanent Supportive Housing system, the number of households served was 2,091, a historic high. The occupancy rate decreased to 84% due to 1) difficulty in

finding scattered sites affordable housing to rent in the community and 2) delays and difficulty processing housing applications for qualified households.

- Beth Fetzter-Rice asked how many units the system lost in the first quarter. At the October CoC meeting, CSB reported on the trending loss of once-affordable units. Lianna confirmed that 400 units came off the market with the loss of LatitudeFive25 in December.
- ⟨ The system-wide number of families served increased by 2% (FY22 1,233) when compared to the same reporting period of the prior fiscal year. We continue to monitor the equitable distribution of successful housing exits across gender and race for all subpopulations. We are presenting for the first time a dashboard for single adults, similar to our other dashboards.
 - Lark Mallory asked if the disparities in successful outcomes for the black subpopulation in RRH matches historical disparities. Lianna explained that CSB began tracking this data approximately a year-and-a-half ago, and so does not have a large enough sample to extrapolate a pattern. For the data that we currently have, there is no pattern in the disparities we are identifying.
 - More than 4400 single adults were served system wide, with over half in PSH.
 - 154 pregnant women, a 23% decrease compared to the same reporting period of the prior fiscal year, were served with a 100% success rate in Homelessness Prevention.
 - 613 Transitional Age Youth were served; there was a 20% increase in TAY served in PSH; 84% were successful in Homelessness Prevention.
 - In the Veterans system, 828 veterans were served with a 100% success rate in Homelessness Prevention; the majority were served in PSH.
 - Emerald asked if the system is approaching functional zero. Carl Landry explained that the system has met 3 out of the 4 metrics for functional zero for several months, but the fourth metric is difficult to meet given the number of new veterans entering the system versus veterans already served. In 2022, Veterans Affairs set the national goal to house 38,000 veterans. The local target was successfully exceeded, as was the national target with 40,401 veterans successfully housed.
 - Lianna will send Emerald CSB's monthly report on veterans.

AHAR - Analysis of National and Local Homelessness Data

HUD issues the AHAR report, deriving data from the PIT count and the Longitudinal System Analysis data. CSB compares the AHAR to local data. This is a simple analysis which cannot account for differences in populations at the local level.

- ⟨ The items to note are the disproportionate rate of black/African Americans in shelters compared to nationwide rates and similarly of those reporting DV histories. Columbus' Permanent Supportive Housing programs are seeing an aging population,

servicing more seniors than nationwide. This could be because our system specifically targets those with the highest vulnerabilities, which includes seniors and people with disabilities.

- < Michael noted that, in the US, 14% of people are black/African American; in Columbus, this is 24%.
- < Lianna explained CSB will compare the AHAR to the census and the population in Franklin County, then take a deeper dive by comparing to the population of Franklin County that lives in poverty.
- < Shannon Isom called out the fact that housing itself is based on a disparate system whether that data has been tracked across quarters or years, and that we must assume everything we do is a disparity.
 - o Lark concurred and emphasized that we, as a system and community, must not lose sight of racial disparities. Our community, and the US as a whole, is facing housing issues overall, but black/African American people feel the brunt of these issues.
 - o Emerald Hernandez-Parra added that the City has dealt with significant backlash from the community with the temporary winter warming centers and other affordable housing initiatives.

Crisis Prevention program update

- < As of January 31, 8 Crisis Specialists are working in NCR, CHN, Huckleberry House, YWCA, and Homefull programs.
 - o 4 more Specialists have pending start dates at Homefull and YMCA; other partners continue to interview and move toward the goal of 20 Specialists. Unfortunately, hiring remains a challenge for partners in this initiative.
- < Southeast is still in the process of hiring a Crisis Coordinator who will hold monthly Practice Groups. The next group training will take place the first week of March.
- < Crisis Specialists have completed HMIS training and are conducting data entry for initiative evaluation purposes with Measurement Resources Company.
- < Initial reports are that Specialists are having significant positive impacts with clients.
 - o A Crisis Prevention Specialist at Creekside Place was reported to have prevented a suicide.

Latitude Five25 Relocation

- < In December, CSB coordinated relocation to two area hotels for 123 community households impacted by the emergency closure of Latitude Five25 towers.
 - o In addition to the temporary hotel stay, we are providing food and transportation and have arranged for 3rd shift security. Staff have been implemented to help direct community members to resources as needed.

- < CSB has been referring to and working collaboratively with Rosetta Brown, a Relocation Specialist contracted to work with community members on permanent housing.

COVID-19 and Overflow update

- < The Shelter for Isolation and Quarantine (SIQ) remains open. As of January 31, the current census is 1; the SIQ team is prepared for any increase.
- < CSB is planning to operationalize system processes for COVID positive clients once COVID funds expire.
- < Additional system capacity continues through the winter.
- < Additional overnight winter programs are being operated by Columbus Coalition for the Homeless and Community Development for All People
 - o The focus of Coalition overnight programs has been to engage clients who have not entered shelter previously or have not been as successful in maintaining traditional shelter.

Meeting adjourned.