MINUTES
Columbus and Franklin County, Ohio
Continuum of Care Meeting
Thursday, January 18, 2024
10:30am – 12:30pm
Hybrid Meeting; In-person at Community Shelter Board

Continuum of Care (CoC) members (in attendance): Alison Marker, Beth Fetzer-Rice, Buck Bramlish, Chanda Wingo, Christopher Maitland, Donna Mayer, Dr. Desiree Polk-Bland, Dr. Maria Houston, Vunessa Allen-Martin (representing Felisha Lyons), Frank Beel, Hannah Estabrook, Jeff Pattison, Jim Rose, Kelsey Strausbaugh, Kier Scott, Le-Ann Harris, Malcolm Turner, Marcus Johnson, Michael Wilkos, Rei Scott, Roxann Payne, Shannon Isom, Sonya Higginbotham, Sue Darby, Sue Villilo, Terri Power, Tresalyn Butler-Sharpe, Vivian Turner

Community Shelter Board (CSB) staff: Lianna Barbu, Steve Skovensky, Kirstin Jones, Gillian Gunawan

Continuum of Care (CoC) members (not in attendance): Adam Troy (Community of Caring Foundation), Carl Landry (Veterans Administration), Emerald Hernandez-Parra (City of Columbus), Emily Savors (The Columbus Foundation), Hannah Diewald (Franklin County), Jonathan Welty (Ohio Capital Corporation for Housing), Lark Mallory (Affordable Housing Trust Corporation), Lt. Kyle Kincade (Columbus Police Department), Nathan P Wymer (CSB Board), Scott Scharlach (Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority), Sheila Prillerman (Citizens Advisory Council), Tiara Ross (Office of the Columbus City Attorney), Tina Rutherford (Franklin County Children Services)

Guest(s): Steve Totzke

Administrative Issues

Approve minutes from September 15, 2023 meeting
Michael asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the September 15, 2023 meeting. Frank Beel motioned, Alison Marker seconded, and the CoC approved.

Annual Financial Report
Lianna Barbu presented the annual financial report for FY23 which summarizes system-wide sources and uses of funds and analyzes costs per households served and costs per successful outcomes for all program types.

⟨ There is a 103% overall variance in budgeted revenue versus actual revenue due to CSB receiving additional funds from the City of Columbus and Franklin County for crisis situations, such as Sawyer Towers and surge funding for emergency shelters. Year-over-year, revenue has increased.

〈 Sources of Funds are split between CSB Funds and Partner Agency Leveraged Funds. CSB brought in $42 million, Partner Agencies leveraged $25 million.
   o Christopher Maitland asked if Partner Agency Leveraged Funds are an area of risk or concern. Lianna answered that these are funds that Partner Agencies raise independently, with the major sources of funding being CMHA rental subsidies/vouchers, fundraising efforts, and Medicare/Medicaid.
   o Beth Fetzer-Rice added that, as a CSB-funded Partner Agency, Home for Families does not report non-renewal funding to CSB.
   o Shannon added that these leveraged funds can be tenuous, depending on the political climate. Leveraged funds make up about 38% of total sources of funds. CSB has continuously heard PAs say it is a harder lift each year to gain the exact same funding.
〈 Actual Expenses show actual expenditures, CSB and leveraged cost variances, a breakdown of Households (HH) Served or Program Capacities, Total Cost and CSB Cost per HHs Served, and Total Cost and CSB Cost per Successful HH.
   o The Total Cost per Successful HH showcases which configurations are most successful. Cost per HH has increased year-over-year.
   o Lianna explained that some programs were not able to spend 100% of their funds due to staff turnover and hiring issues. There is a direct connection between staffing gaps and the programs' inability to serve the number of households they were initially projected to serve.
   o Sue Darby added that the YMCA has increased pay to retain staff. She is thankful the YMCA can show staff the value of their work.
   o Vivian asked if providers are graded on performance. Lianna answered yes, and those performance results are presented to the CoC.
〈 PSH Unit Cost Matrix
   o Lianna explained that this document compares the FY24 PSH unit budget to the FY23 actual PSH unit costs, broken out by program, in order to examine average costs by project type (single- vs scattered-site), tenant attributes, staff availability, and household type. Actual costs increased by about $1,000 year-over-year.
   o The FY24 budget predicted the total on-going average homeless unit cost to be $16,173. The actual average cost per unit for FY23 is $15,154. CSB and HUD contribute on average $6,662 per unit.
   o Single-site projects cost $16,632 and scattered-site projects cost $11,541 per unit. Lianna explained that single-site projects naturally cost more because these projects necessitate having front desk staff, security, and other operating costs.
   o High-need tenants cost more on average than medium-need: $18,026 for high-need, $12,461 for low-need.
   o Intensive staff availability projects cost more on average than moderate or limited staff availability: $20,935 for intensive, $12,043 for moderate, and $14,549 for limited.

- - Families cost less to house than single adults: single households cost on average $16,741; family households cost on average $9,977.

Prioritization for Ohio Housing Finance Agency tax credits

- ⟨ The Ohio Housing Finance Agency tax credit competition is the primary way for new Permanent Supportive Housing to be built in Columbus. HUD has not yet announced awards from the 2023 CoC Competition.
- ⟨ CHN submitted two project plans for consideration for the 2024 OHFA competition: Scioto Rise and Knoll View Place.
    - ⟨ Both projects will cost about $331k per unit to develop; this cost is now typical. CMHA has committed vouchers to both projects.
    - ⟨ Scioto Rise
        - ⟨ Lianna noted that CHN's Scioto Rise project was called Deer Hill Place in the 2023 CoC competition, but the name was changed due to a change in site, because OHFA's new QAP scoring system awards more points based on site location, and the new 3245 Morse Rd site will score better in the OHFA competition. CD4AP currently owns this site and will sell to CHN.
        - ⟨ Construction will finish in August 2026, with lease-up beginning in Fall 2026.
        - ⟨ Alison Marker asked what happens if HUD does not award the project in the 2023 CoC Competition. Lianna answered that we would apply again in 2024.
        - ⟨ Michael asked what criteria OHFA's rating system looks for that will allow the new location to score better. Lianna explained that OHFA considers transit accessibility and grocery store access, for example. The new Scioto Rise location is close to Walmart, Saraga International Grocery, and Kroger.
        - ⟨ Michael informed the group about LinkUS Columbus, an $8 billion project focused on enhancing connectivity between public transit, sidewalks, bike lanes, and other forms of transportation. LinkUS will create more transportation options, increasing access to jobs, housing, greenspace and entertainment. He hopes these new PSH developments are considered in this project.
    - ⟨ Knoll View Place
        - ⟨ The Knoll View Place project plan has been updated since the 2023 CoC competition. The project now includes a replacement project. The number of units increased by 30, such that there will now be 30 replacement HUD units, 16 new HUD units, and 4 ADAMH units.
        - ⟨ Construction will finish in August 2026, with lease-up beginning in Winter 2026.
- ⟨ Alison asked how many projects are prioritized for OHFA each year, and how many projects will OHFA award. Lianna answered that we always aim to submit at least one

project; the OHFA competition is state-wide, and OHFA tends to award three projects at the most.

〈 Michael commented that four-story L-shaped 60-unit buildings seem to be the "sweet spot" for PSH developments. Lianna stated that this configuration is typical of CHN, it may differ for other developers.

〈 Sue added that a PSH development is constrained by the property itself. She explained that a property can meet CoC development criteria, but not be big enough to hold 100 units. Terri Power added that some advocates don't like 100-unit buildings, because the configuration feels too similar to an institutional setting. She added that Medicaid billing is important to be considered as a revenue source.

〈 Shannon asked if 50-60 units per year is enough to keep up with need. Lianna answered that this is not enough. Our system needs about 1,800 additional PSH units, and 50-60 new units per year will never be able to fill the gap. She added that our system needs alternative ways to bring new PSH units into the community besides literal construction, especially when units cost about $350,000 apiece.

〈 Beth asked if Transitional Housing is a possible route. Lianna answered that Transitional Housing cannot be funded with Federal dollars, and Buck Bramlish added that HUD does not consider TH a viable approach to ending homelessness.

  〈 Shannon commented that, despite HUD's strategy, TH can be very beneficial for certain subpopulations, such as youth, those experiencing DV, and veterans.

〈 Michael asked for thoughts on the voter-approved Affordable Housing bonds. $200 million was approved in November 2019, and will be available soon to jump start production of affordable housing.

  〈 Lianna responded that this is something Shannon has been speaking on. Our system needs more funds and more diversity in type of housing, we must be more cost efficient. Looking nationally, we must consider what can we preserve, reuse, or rehabilitate. Right now, our system is focusing on reusing hotels for PSH. Steve Totzke is present as a guest because of his expertise in hotels. She asked, how can we utilize the existing infrastructure that is going unused?

  〈 Shannon added that under-utilized properties could be an option as well. Simply, if we had less restrictive funds, we could renovate or repurpose such properties.

〈 Beth asked if building and zoning codes are in support of the hotel strategy, and what we as a system can do to help move the process along.

  〈 Lianna stated that permit and zoning issues are slowing us down. We have been working on converting a building at 1289 Dublin Granville Rd since January 2023. We asked City Council for a zoning variance, and they approved. However, we are still waiting to move through the process a year later.

〈 Michael informed the group about Zone In Columbus, a project where the City of Columbus is modernizing its zoning code for the first time in more than 70 years. He

expressed his full support for the project, and asked for CoC members to research and get behind the project as well.

⟨ In terms of OHFA prioritization, CSB suggests that the CoC prioritize Scioto Rise first, same as was done for the CoC competition. QAP now allows for local mental health agencies to also prioritize a project for OHFA tax credits and receive the same number of prioritization points as the first CoC prioritized project; ADAMH will prioritize Knoll View, in agreement with CSB.

⟨ Therefore, both projects could receive the same number of points in the OHFA competition and can both be priorities for Columbus in competition with other projects in Ohio.

Michael asked for a motion to approve the Resolution to Prioritize Permanent Supportive Housing for the 2024 Ohio Housing Finance Agency Application, with Scioto Rise Place as the #1 priority, and Knoll View Place as the #2 priority. Beth Fetzer-Rice motioned, Vivian Turner seconded, and the CoC approved.

<u>CoC Action Plan</u>

The CoC Action Plan was created based on gaps identified in the system through the CoC Application submission. The goal is to tap into subject matter experts on the Continuum of Care and in the community to ensure our system is providing the most appropriate and robust services possible to people experiencing homelessness. Gillian Gunawan presented the CoC Action Plan to the CoC.

⟨ The plan is split into three categories: CoC membership, Racial Equity, and Partnerships. CoC-owned items are noted below:
  o CoC membership lacks subject matter experts and representation specifically from: 1. Organizations led by and serving people with disabilities and 2. State DV Coalition. Two organizations were identified to fill these gaps: 1. PEER Center and 2. Ohio Domestic Violence Network (State DV Coalition).

⟨ Establish a DEI Subcommittee.
  o The Subcommittee will do the detailed work, and the CoC Board will review. CSB will put out a call for volunteers to join the Subcommittee.

⟨ Advance racial equity by making measurable improvements to CoC membership with the underrepresented population in Franklin County. The CoC Board agreed that the representation goal is Franklin County population vs the population served in the system.

⟨ 100% CoC member participation in FY24 self-reported demographic survey.
  o In FY23, 62.5% of CoC members responded to the "Self-Reported Gender/Racial/Ethnic Identity" survey.

⟨ Establish partnership with State Education Agency (SEA).
  o Marcus Johnson made the ask to ODE.

⟨ Establish partnership with State Sexual Assault Coalition.
  o LSS CHOICES agreed to connect with the Ohio Alliance to End Sexual Violence via their relationship with the Ohio Domestic Violence Network.

- ❬ Develop formal partnerships in the form of an MOU/MOA with childhood education agencies.
  - o Scott Scharlach and Michael Wilkos agreed to reach out to relevant contacts.

System and Program Indicator Report

Lianna reviewed highlights from the FY2024 Quarter 1 SPIR, which includes data from 7/1/23 – 9/30/23.

- ❬ A column was added to the "demographics" section which indicates whether a measure has, successfully or unsuccessfully, decreased or increased.
- ❬ Lack of available safe, decent, affordable housing is making it very difficult to quickly and successfully move clients out of shelter.
- ❬ Family Emergency Shelters
  - ❬ When compared to the same period of the prior fiscal year, 18% fewer households needed shelter. The success rate at exit from shelters increased 12 percentage points to 34%, which is comparable to the rates in FY20.
  - ❬ The average length of stay in shelter increased by 25 days to 90 days, the highest level recorded historically.
  - ❬ The employment rate at entry increased from the FY23 annual rate of 27% to 34% currently and the average monthly household income increased to $896 (FY23 $652).
- ❬ Single Adult Emergency Shelters
  - ❬ 1,165 men were served, 499 women were served.
  - ❬ The number of single men and women sheltered decreased 5% and 6%, respectively, when compared to the same reporting period of the prior fiscal year. The success rate for men remained flat at 15%, and increased for women by 12 percentage points to 23%.
    - ▪ Lianna commented that the decrease in number served does not reflect a decrease in demand, just a limit in the sheltering capacity.
  - ❬ The average length of time homeless for men decreased by 7 days, but increased by 7 days for women to the highest level recorded historically (68 days).
  - ❬ The number of pregnant women served increased by 30% compared to FY23 Q1.
- ❬ The Prevention System successfully achieved all outcomes and served fewer households than the prior year.
- ❬ Rapid Re-housing
  - ❬ The number of clients served increased 15% when compared to the same reporting period of the previous year. Number of clients served is finally rebounding post-COVID.
  - ❬ The success rate at exit increased 8 percentage points to 62 percent and the length of participation decreased by 14 days.
- ❬ Total PSH System successfully achieved all outcomes.
  - ❬ The system had a 10% increase in numbers served. The occupancy rate increased 6 percentage points to 90%, but the goal is 95%.

- ⟨ Shannon noted that the number of elderly clients served is increasing. The number of clients age 62 or older increased by 6%.
  - ⟨ Sue Darby added that people who are 62 and older and have been homeless all their lives are very different from people who have had more stable lives before becoming homeless. She shared that when she walks through the YMCA's Van Buren shelter, the population is obviously older than in the past.
  - ⟨ Buck Bramlish added that 5,000 veterans are served a year, and the 60 to 62-year-old veterans served are more like 70-year-old non-homeless non-veterans. Employing this population is difficult.
  - ⟨ Kier Scott commented that it is alarming the percent of people in every category who are working at entry. This is indicative of the broader issues of cost of living, cost of housing, and job quality. People are getting jobs just to survive and are not able to seek the good jobs with stable wages, equitable pay, stable schedules, and benefits.
    - ▪ Shannon concurred, and pointed out that clients' average monthly income has increased from 6 months ago.
    - ▪ Frank Beel added that many of these clients do not have retirement plans due to not earning enough.

Programming Updates

Steve Skovensky presented programming updates to the CoC.

- ⟨ Warming Centers & Winter Overflow
  - o Traditional shelter is available; expanding as needed to accommodate.
    - ▪ Alison Marker asked if warming centers are temporary. Steve answered yes, they are dependent on the weather.
  - o The Daytime Warming Station list is available on CSB's website; Open Shelter is the contracted daytime Warming Center.
    - ▪ West: Looking for new location,
    - ▪ East: 1509 E. Main St, 2nd Floor, 30 beds
    - ▪ South: German Village Motor Inn (will add more rooms—goal to get to 40 beds),
    - ▪ North: America's Best Value Inn, 40 beds.
  - o Utilization of Warming Centers has been strong; at or near capacity; North has been over capacity; as of 1/15, 292 single adults have been served
  - o Couples have been utilizing the warming centers and people with pets; the focus is on people that prefer not to enter traditional shelter
  - o Columbus Coalition for the Homeless has been providing services and linkages, Maryhaven focusing on re-housing services and access to treatment options.
- ⟨ Homelessness Prevention Network
  - o The 3-year pilot program ended on 6/30/23 and moved into year 4 on 7/1/23.

- For all 3 years, 95% of all families served did not enter shelter within 3 months of intervention (goal)
- Currently partnering with City on Housing Resource Specialist implementation in HPN; part of Central Ohio Stable Housing Network
- 28 full-time HRS have been trained on Housing Problem Solving and HMIS to provide prevention and housing stability services
- Vast range of organizations throughout the community
- Referral tool introduced to Access Points this month.

〈 ED Discharge Workgroup
- Began in fall of 2022 and convened by CSB
- Goal: To bring hospital systems, public health, community stakeholders, street outreach and rapid rehousing together for coordination and collaboration
- Goal: Whenever possible eliminate hospital discharges into homelessness; when necessary, coordinate with Crisis System
- Discharge algorithms created for ED, inpatient psychiatric and medical/surgical units
- Older Adult Sub-Group convened by Franklin County Office on Aging; can serve as a model for other populations

〈 Rapid Re-Housing Updates

- The last two quarters of FY23 saw improvements in time to housing (frequency in which individuals and families exit shelter).
- In the first quarter of FY24, RRH system and individual programs showed improvement in time to housing, clients served, and successful housing outcomes.
- In December 2022, the YMCA general RRH program began targeting low-moderate barrier clients with more system intentionality of targeting PSH for clients with the highest barriers/needs.
- In Fall of 2023, the average length of participation in RRH extended for singles and families to be in fidelity with RRH model (240 days, 300 days for family intensive). The goal is greater stability and lower recidivism.
- In FY23, The Salvation Army transitioned the Jobs to Housing RRH and traditional RRH programs to Homes for Families (HFF).
- HFF will expand the Intensive RRH program to serve a larger number of families with complex needs and barriers, focusing on PSH when most appropriate.
- HFF and VOA RRH programs will serve lower barrier families.
- In January 2024, YWCA will begin an RRH program based out of the Family Center.
- Partners are excited about the use of PadMission to complement their housing resources. PadMission is fully funded for two years by Anthem.

Meeting adjourned.