

Meeting Minutes

Continuum of Care Meeting

Monday, January 27, 2020

11:00am – 12:30pm

Community Shelter Board

Attendees

Continuum of Care (CoC) Members: Andy Keller, Attalah London, Tatyanna Lucas, Buck Bramlish, Carl Landry, Chad Meek, Tina Rutherford, Debbie Donahey, Dennis Jeffrey, Dion Robinson, Donna Mayer, Emerald Hernandez, Felisha Lyons, Jeff Pattison, Jerome Johnson, Jon Cardi, Jon Welty, Amy Funk, Kim Stands, Michelle Heritage, Nancy Case, Christopher Maitland, Robin Harris, Sam Shuler, Sue Villilo, Adam Negley

Community Shelter Board (CSB) staff: Tom Albanese, Lianna Barbu, Hannah King

Guests: Amy Rosenthal, Michelle Norris (N^^); Holly Saelens (Molina Healthcare); Ryan Cassell, Noel Welsh (CHN); Sue Darby (YMCA); Lynn Rosenthal (Center for Family Safety and Healing); Matthew Zelnik (Franklin County Veterans Service Commission)

Continuum of Care (CoC) Members (not in attendance): Becky Westerfelt (Huckleberry House), Emily Savors (Columbus Foundation), Geoff Stobart (Franklin County Jail), Mark Paxson (Franklin County), John Edgar (Church and Community Development for All People), Keith McCormish (Columbus Coalition for the Homeless), Kythryn Carr Harris (ADAMH Board), Michael Wilkos (United Way of Central Ohio), Lisa Defendiefer (Capital Crossroads & Discovery SID), Lisa Patt-McDaniel (Workforce Development Board of Central Ohio), Paula Haines (Freedom a la Cart), Sheila Prillerman (CSB Board), Steve Gladman (Affordable Housing Trust), Terri Power (Corporation for Supportive Housing)

Welcome and Agenda Review/Approval

Kim welcomed the group and reviewed the agenda.

PSH Development

Lianna reviewed the permanent housing development process. The CoC is responsible for reviewing, approving, and prioritizing Concept Papers and Project Plans. She provided an overview of the three Project Plans scheduled for presentation and prioritization at this meeting.

N^^ Berwyn East Place Project Plan

Amy Rosenthal of National Church Residences (N^^) presented the details of the proposed development.

- < The project will have 88 one-bedroom units and is located on East Livingston Avenue, adjacent to N^^ Common at Livingston.
- < The target population is people 55 years of age and older with advanced geriatric conditions. Thirty-six units are designated for people experiencing homelessness, and 52 units are designated for extremely low-income seniors. A portion of each block of units is designated for individuals associated with UnitedHealth Group (UHG) or Molina Healthcare plans. Prospective tenants for these units must be covered by one of the two health plans at move-in.

- < The project will use a “triple blend” management model integrating property management, care coordination, and onsite health and wellness services with the goal of helping residents age in place. N^^ is the service provider. People who have experienced homelessness present with the medical needs of non-homeless individuals twenty years older.
- < The approximate cost of the project is \$15.6 million. Traditional capital sources will be used. CMHA has committed 44 Housing Choice Vouchers (HCV), and Molina Healthcare and UHG have provided service commitments. The building will be fully leased in summer 2022.
- < Michelle Norris noted that N^^’s Board passed a resolution in 2000 relative to the Commons at Grant project which formalized the organization’s commitment to pursue housing projects for people who have experienced homelessness. She pointed out N^^’s 20+ year history with CSB and gave examples of how N^^’s service model has evolved over time to meet community needs. The Berwyn East Place project strives to holistically serve the community’s growing senior population while recognizing changes in the healthcare industry that have resulted from the Affordable Care Act.
- < Holly Saelens shared Molina’s excitement about participating in housing initiatives for the benefit of their members.

CHN Poplar Fen Place Project Plan

Ryan Cassell of Community Housing Network (CHN) presented the details of the proposed development.

- < The project will have 40 one-bedroom units and is located on Chatterton Road, adjacent to Marsh Brook Place. The building would open in fall 2022.
- < The target population is people 55 years of age and older with a disability. Thirty-two units are designated for people experiencing homelessness, and 8 units are designated for homeless or at-risk individuals with a serious mental illness.
- < The project will offer integrated primary and behavioral health services. Aryes will operate a 24/7 front desk, as recommended by the Citizens Advisory Council (CAC). N^^ is the service provider. Ryan described the community need for housing for seniors who have experienced homelessness and noted CHN’s experience in serving this population at its former Hotel St. Clair location. N^^ started providing supportive services at CHN properties two years ago and is now the service partner for four projects.
- < Because this project is adjacent to Marsh Brook Place, community engagement is already strong. The close proximity of the two projects provides opportunities for intergenerational programming. CHN plans to heed the CAC’s advice on this concept by designing intentional, tenant-driven programming.
- < Capital sources include Ohio Housing Finance Agency (OHFA) Housing Development Assistance Program, City and County HOME, and Federal Home Loan Bank (FHLB) funds. No rental subsidy commitment has been secured to date.
- < Buck observed that CHN PSH properties tend to be colocated and asked whether there is a downside to this concentration of units, such as economic depression. Ryan replied that communities sometimes voice this concern, but the total number of units proposed for Marsh Brook Place and Poplar Fen Place is 80, which is relatively low. CHN tries to secure development sites throughout the city, but is limited by the availability of bus lines, affordable property, rezoning barriers, and the willingness of sellers to take their property off the market during the lengthy tax credit application process.

- < Nancy asked how tenant rent responsibility would be calculated at both of the projects presented thus far. Michelle Norris answered that at Berwyn East Place, 44 units would have rent subsidies through HCVs and tenants would be required to contribute 30% of their income toward rent. The remaining units would be income-restricted and rents would be determined on a sliding scale. At Poplar Fen Place, all units would have rent subsidies and tenants would be required to contribute 30% of their income toward rent.
- < Jon Cardi confirmed the cost per unit for Poplar Fen Place (\$238,996) and asked whether there is an opportunity for greater impact at a lower cost. Ryan noted that that the proposed development is small, which drives up the cost per unit. PSH is more expensive to develop than market rate housing, largely due to heavy regulation. Additionally, market rate housing can be paid off through ongoing operational revenue; operational revenue is much lower for PSH. An upside to small PSH developments is that communities are more accepting of the projects since there is a low concentration of people with extremely low incomes. Ryan referenced a 2014 [Enterprise and Urban Land Institute study](#) which details other factors that contribute to the high cost of affordable rental housing development.
- < Michelle Heritage noted that the CoC may be able to support the City in its efforts to garner support for the development of affordable housing county-wide. Emerald added that CoC members can help counter misinformation and assumptions about PSH developments and residents in gatherings like area commission meetings.
- < Jon Cardi questioned whether the prioritization of seniors in PSH development is the best strategy for the community, given that seniors are a small segment of the local population.

CHN Touchstone Field Place Project Plan

Ryan Cassell of Community Housing Network (CHN) presented the details of the proposed development.

- < The project will have 56 one-bedroom units and is located on Lockbourne Road in the Marion Franklin neighborhood. This would be the first of two Touchstone Field Place phases. The second phase would have 44 units.
- < The target population is chronically homeless individuals with a disability. Forty-four of the 56 units will be made available to YMCA's current 40 W. Long Street residents. The project will offer integrated primary and behavioral health services.
- < Sue Darby (YMCA) summarized YMCA's decision to close the 40 W. Long Street building, whose maintenance and depreciation costs result in large losses for the organization annually. She described the current single room occupancy units, which are small and lack private restrooms and kitchen space. Touchstone Field Place will offer higher quality efficiency units. In order to maintain continuity of care, YMCA will provide supportive services and operate the 24/7 front desk.
- < Ryan explained that FHLB does not consider transferred residents to be homeless. In order to retain eligibility for FHLB funds, CHN will dedicate 12 units to chronically homeless individuals who will not transfer from an existing project. CHN has secured a commitment from CMHA for 56 HCVs.

After the presentations concluded, Kim reviewed the proposed resolution to prioritize PSH projects for the 2020 OHFA application. The CoC Board has recommended the following prioritization for the OHFA application and City/County capital development funds, pending availability and OHFA prioritization:

Project Name	Priority
Touchstone Field Place	1
Berwyn East Place	2
Poplar Fen Place	3

- < Michelle Heritage noted that N^^'s Berwyn East Place project is not in alignment with the prioritization resolution passed by the CoC on November 19, 2019. However, the project concept was in development before this resolution was passed. The CoC Board recommends the project be grandfathered in and eligible for prioritization. No opposition was voiced by the group. Michelle explained that the CoC Board has recommended giving Touchstone Field Place first priority because the project will provide replacement units for individuals who are currently housed.
- < Debbie asked what will happen to the YMCA residents who are not able to transfer to Touchstone Field Place. Michelle replied that YMCA is strategizing how they can replace these very affordable units elsewhere in the community. Kim added that YMCA is looking at a five year timeframe to relocate all residents, and the earliest any residents would be relocated is two years from now. YMCA has committed to rehousing all of its current residents.
- < Nancy moved to approve the following prioritization for the 2020 OHFA tax credit application process: Touchstone Field Place; Berwyn East Place; Poplar Fen Place. She moved to recommend the same prioritization for City of Columbus and Franklin County capital development funds, pending availability and OHFA prioritization. Chad Meek seconded, Sam Shuler abstained, and Jon Cardi opposed the motion. The motion passed.
- < Michelle Heritage asked Jon Cardi to share why he opposed the motion. Jon explained that the CoC has approved PSH developments in the past that cost \$108,000 - \$140,000 per unit, and the cost per unit for the projects prioritized today is much higher than this. He does not think this is the best use of the community's funds and suggested the CoC consider other ways to approach the need for additional housing in the community.

Administrative Issues

Minutes

Kim asked for any corrections to or comments on the minutes from the November 11, 2019 CoC meeting. Michelle Heritage moved to approve the minutes, Jerome seconded, and the CoC agreed.

Annual Financial Report

Lianna presented the annual financial report for FY19, which summarizes system-wide sources and uses of funds and analyzes costs per households served and costs per successful outcomes for all program types.

- < City, County, and State revenues show variances between budgeted and actual amounts because these grants' contract periods do not align with CSB's fiscal year. CSB does spend 100% of these grant funds. CSB manages the timing, scope, and use of 80 - 100 funding sources annually.
- < Christopher referenced CSB's recent requests for additional rapid rehousing and prevention funds. He asked whether this funding, if granted, would go to new or existing programs. Michelle answered that the funding would be used to expand existing programs that serve families.

PSH Unit Cost Matrix

Lianna presented the PSH unit cost matrix, which compares different variations of PSH, analyzing the actual per-unit costs of each type versus budgeted amounts. This allows the CoC to identify trends and provides a baseline for evaluating future PSH developments.

- < The actual mean cost of a homeless unit was \$12,918, less than the budgeted mean of \$14,334.
- < Single-site PSH units have higher costs due to the cost of front desk services.

Strategic Issues

FY20 Q1 System and Program Indicator Report

Lianna provided a brief overview of this regular report.

- < Netcare Access Homeless Hotline, Huckleberry House Emergency Shelter for Youth, and Maryhaven Engagement Center were recognized as programs of excellence. Maryhaven's Engagement Center performance is especially notable, as it has improved greatly despite the high needs and historically low successful outcomes of those it serves.
- < Family System Emergency Shelter: At 40 days, the average length of stay has more than doubled since FY16 (then 19 days). The average nightly occupancy has reached the highest rate historically at 194 households. This negatively impacts the rate of successful housing outcomes. Family shelters are operating in an overflow state year-round.
- < A new special population dashboard has been added for families. Over 1,000 families were served system-wide during Q1. The rates of successful housing outcomes by program type indicate that rapid rehousing and prevention are the most effective programs in which to invest.
- < Kim reminded the group that the full report is available on [CSB's website](#) for further perusal.

System and Community Framework Updates

Neither System Gaps nor Veterans were discussed due to time constraints.

Tom reported that CSB will conduct the annual Point-in-Time Count on Wednesday, January 29. Volunteers are still needed; please contact Erin Maus at CSB if you are available and interested. The results of the Count will be shared at the next CoC meeting.

Meeting Adjourned.